



Federal Janitorial Contract Audit A2012-11

Issued by the
Internal Audit Office
November 20, 2012

**City of El Paso
Internal Audit Office
Federal Janitorial Contract Audit A2012-11**

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The Internal Audit Office has concluded its audit of the Janitorial Services Contract #2010-204 between the City of El Paso and Federal Janitorial STG, LLC commencing on October 18, 2010 for janitorial services for the Seville, Westside (Don Haskins) and Chihuahuita Recreation Centers. Based on the results of the audit, four (4) findings were developed identifying that the City of El Paso was overbilled \$3,605.20 by Federal Janitorial STG, LLC. All four (4) of these findings are considered significant in nature. Federal Janitorial STG, LLC overbilled the City of El Paso in the following categories:

#	Description	Amount
1	Duplicate payments for the month of June 2012	\$1,861.43
2	Over payment on six invoices for monthly janitorial services for the three facilities ranging from November 2011 to June 2012	\$1,598.27
3	Over payment for After Party Clean-Ups	\$145.50
Total Amount Due Back to the City of El Paso		\$3,605.20

Listed below is a summary of the four (4) significant findings identified in this report.

1. Federal Janitorial STG, LLC submitted three (3) duplicate invoices for the month June 2012 resulting in overpayment of \$1,861.43.
2. Federal Janitorial STG, LLC overbilled the City of El Paso \$1,598.27 on six invoices for regular monthly janitorial services from November 2011 to June 2012. The invoices submitted for payment had the following irregularities:
 - Six of six (100%) invoices did not have Sign-in sheets or Performance Rating Forms with sufficient hours to support the amount being billed,
 - Six of six (100%) invoices were not itemized or showed the number of hours worked by the individual Porters,
 - Six of six (100%) invoices were dated before services were rendered,
 - Four of six (67%) invoices did not have Sign-in Sheets to document hours worked by the Porter.
3. Federal Janitorial STG, LLC overbilled the City of El Paso \$145.50 for After-Party Clean-ups.
4. The Parks and Recreation Department used eight (8) unencumbered vouchers instead of using the Purchase Order established for the Janitorial Services Contract #2010-204 to pay Federal Janitorial STG, LLC.

For a detailed explanation of each of the findings please refer to the appropriate finding contained in the body of this Audit Report.

BACKGROUND

The City of El Paso awarded Janitorial Services Contract #2010-204 to Federal Janitorial STG, LLC for janitorial services provided to three Recreation Centers, Westside (Don Haskins), Seville, and Chihuahuita. The initial contract period is from October 18, 2010 through September 3, 2013. There is an option to extend the contract for an additional year if the option is exercised prior to the expiration of the initial term. The estimated award value is \$74,140.98.

AUDIT OBJECTIVES

The objectives of this audit were to determine if Federal Janitorial STG, LLC was adhering to the terms and conditions of the Janitorial Services Contract #2010-204 for the time period of September 1, 2011 to August 31, 2012.

AUDIT SCOPE

The audit period covered the operations of September 1, 2011 to August 31, 2012.

AUDIT METHODOLOGY

To achieve our audit objectives we:

- Obtained an understanding of Janitorial Services Contract #2010-204,
- Verified that Porters were working the actual number of hours and days as specified under the contract,
- Reviewed invoices to ensure that they are showing the actual number hours each employee worked per day,
- Reconciled hours worked with hours billed on invoices,
- Verified all Porters were signing in and out when arriving and leaving the Recreation Centers on daily basis,
- Confirmed compliance with Hazard Communication Act (Article 5182B),
- Verified that Porters are undergoing a Background Check on an annual basis,
- Verified that contracted services were provided in accordance with the agreement.

We conducted this performance audit in accordance with Generally Accepted Government Auditing Standards. Those standards require that we plan and perform the audit to obtain sufficient, appropriate evidence to provide a reasonable basis for our findings and conclusions based on our audit objectives. We believe that the evidence obtained provides a reasonable basis for our findings and conclusions based on our audit objectives.

This audit was also conducted in conformance with the International Standards for the Professional Practice of Internal Auditing issued by the Institute of Internal Auditors.

***SIGNIFICANT FINDINGS, RECOMMENDATIONS,
AND MANAGEMENT’S RESPONSES***

The definition of a “Significant Finding” is one that has a material effect on the City of El Paso’s financial statements, identifies an internal control breakdown, a violation of a City procedure, or a violation of a law and/or regulation, which the City is required to follow. Any finding not meeting these criteria will be classified as a “Regular Finding”.

Finding: 1

Duplicate Payment

Section 26.2.1 of the City of El Paso’s Account Payable Manual, states the following:

- *The Supervisor or authorizing official should sign off on the document to ensure that there is compliance with contract or quoted prices.*

Federal Janitorial STG, LLC submitted three (3) duplicate invoices for the month of June 2012. The total amount of the duplicate billing is \$1,861.43. The invoice numbers and amounts for the duplicate payment are as follows:

#	Invoice	Invoice Date	Description	Actual Payment Amount	Date Paid
1	8876	6/26/2012	Monthly Janitorial for Don Haskins	\$930.23	7/3/2012
2	8874	6/26/2012	Monthly Janitorial Service for Chihuahuita	\$465.60	7/3/2012
3	8875	6/26/2012	Monthly Janitorial Service for Seville	\$465.60	7/3/2012
			Total	\$1,861.43	

Recommendation:

The Parks and Recreation Department needs to verify invoices received against the hours worked by the janitorial service personnel. The hours worked must be documented on Sign In/Out sheets located at the Recreation Center.

The Parks and Recreation Department needs to request a refund of \$1,861.43 from Federal Janitorial STG, LLC for the overpayment.

**City of El Paso
Internal Audit Office
Federal Janitorial Contract Audit A2012-11**

Management's Response:

The Parks and Recreation Department has implemented a procedure on July 16, 2012, that requires a sign-in/sign-out sheet be filled in by the vendor porters each time they come on shift and depart. This form is countersigned by on-duty center staff. Each week, the Center Director completes a janitorial inspection sheet. This sheet is reviewed and signed by the Center Director and Vendor Supervisor. These forms are scanned weekly and copied to a P:drive folder.

To process the vendor invoice, division accounting staff reviews the sign-in/sign-out sheets and compares to the contract work schedule. If there are discrepancies, then staff reflect it on a summary spreadsheet which is scanned and placed on the P:drive. Department accounting staff review the monthly invoice and compare to the scanned information in the P:drive. If there is less work performed by labor hours documented through this process, then the approved payment is reduced accordingly and processed for final payment.

A letter requesting reimbursement has been sent to Federal Janitorial STG, LLC. See attached copy.

Responsible Party:

Tracy Novak, Assistant Parks and Recreation Director, 541-4259

Robert Cortinas, Business/Finance Manager, 541-4335

Implementation Date:

January 7, 2013

Finding: 2

Monthly Janitorial Service Invoice

Janitorial Services Contract #2010-204 – Westside, Seville, and Chihuahuita Recreation Center states the following:

- *Section B Line 1, Invoices will show the number of hours each employee worked per day. Contractor will not be paid for hours that were not worked.*
- *Section B Line 2, All janitorial personnel will sign in and out when arriving and leaving on a daily basis.*
- *Section C Line A, Invoices will be itemized, including serial number of unit; transportation charges, if any will be listed separately.*

Section 17.1 City of El Paso’s Account Payable Manual dated November 1, 2012 states the following:

- *If the goods and or services have been received and the quantity and price match the purchase order or the non-encumbered order, the invoice will be approved for payment by the assigned personnel.*

Six invoices for monthly janitorial services ranging from November 2011 to June 2012 were reviewed and contained the following discrepancies:

- Six of six (100%) invoice amounts reviewed did not have Sign-in sheets or Performance Rating forms with sufficient hours to support the amounts being billed. This resulted in an overpayment of \$1,598.27 to Federal Janitorial STG, LLC.
- Six of six (100%) invoices were not itemized and did not show the number of hours worked by the individual Porter.
- Six of six (100%) invoices were paid 7 to 19 days in advance before janitorial services were rendered.
- Four of six (66.67%) invoices did not have Sign-in Sheets to document hours worked by the Porters.

Recommendation:

The Parks and Recreation Department needs to ensure that:

- Invoices are paid only for services that are rendered,
- Hours on the Sign-in sheets and Performance Rating forms confirm the amount being billed on the invoice,
- Sign-in sheets and Performance Rating forms are received by the Recreation Centers as supporting documentation for the invoice,
- Invoices state the time period that is being billed,
- Invoices are itemized and document the number of hours worked by each employee of Federal Janitorial STG, LLC.

The Parks and Recreation Department needs to request a refund of \$1,598.27 from Federal Janitorial STG, LLC for the overpayment.

**City of El Paso
Internal Audit Office
Federal Janitorial Contract Audit A2012-11**

Management's Response:

The Parks and Recreation Department has implemented a procedure on July 16, 2012, that requires a sign-in/sign-out sheet be filled in by the vendor porters each time they come on shift and depart. This form is countersigned by on-duty center staff. Each week, the Center Director completes a janitorial inspection sheet. This sheet is reviewed and signed by the Center Director and Vendor Supervisor. These forms are scanned weekly and copied to a P:drive folder.

To process the vendor invoice, division accounting staff reviews the sign-in/sign-out sheets and compares to the contract work schedule. If there are discrepancies, then staff reflect it on a summary spreadsheet which is scanned and placed on the P:drive. Department accounting staff review the monthly invoice and compare to the scanned information in the P:drive. If there is less work performed by labor hours documented through this process, then the approved payment is reduced accordingly and processed for final payment.

Prior to processing payments, the Business/Finance Manager will ensure invoices state the time period being billed.

A letter requesting reimbursement has been sent to Federal Janitorial STG, LLC. See attached copy.

Responsible Party:

Tracy Novak, Assistant Parks and Recreation Director, 541-4259

Robert Cortinas, Business/Finance Manager, 541-4335

Implementation Date:

January 7, 2013

Finding: 3

After Party Clean-Up Invoices

Section 7.1 of the City of El Paso's Account Payable Manual, dated November 1, 2012 states:

- *If the goods and or services have been received and the quantity and price match the purchase order or the non-encumbered order, the invoice will be approved for payment by the assigned personnel.*

Eight invoices for After Party Clean-ups contained the following discrepancies:

- Two of eight (25%) invoices for After Party Clean-Ups were not located in the Active Net System. This resulted in an overpayment of \$145.50:

Invoice Date	Invoice	Amount Paid	Comments
6/04/2012	8836	\$ 97.00	For two events that were not found in the Active Net System.
5/14/2012	8783	\$ 48.50	The invoice did not specify the event date and an event was not found close to the date of the invoice in the Active Net System.
	Total	\$ 145.50	

- Eight of eight (100%) invoices did not contain the number of hours worked by the Porter or have Sign-in sheets and Performance Rating Forms documenting that an after party cleaning was performed.
- Four of eight (50%) invoices were billed before the event date.

Recommendation:

The Parks and Recreation Department needs to ensure:

- That sign-in sheets and Performance Rating forms are received before approving invoices,
- That an event actually occurred before approving and paying invoices,
- That Federal Janitorial STG, LLC does not submit invoices in advance of services being rendered.

The Parks and Recreation Department needs to request a refund of \$145.50 from Federal Janitorial STG, LLC for the overpayment.

**City of El Paso
Internal Audit Office
Federal Janitorial Contract Audit A2012-11**

Management's Response:

The Department will utilize the same procedures outlined in Findings 1 and 2 that requires a sign-in/sign-out sheet be filled in by the vendor porters each time they come on shift and depart. The sign-in/sign-out sheet for after party cleanups will be located in a separate tabbed section of the binder for these forms, so it is clear to anyone where the form is located.

As these forms are scanned weekly and sent to a P:drive folder, division accounting staff will verify the sign-in/sign-out sheets are completed. If this documentation reflects that work hours have not been performed, then the spreadsheet will reflect the reduced hours and payment will be reduced accordingly. Since the P:drive will have all the backup documentation, Department accounting staff can verify the information prior to submitting the invoice for payment.

Department accounting staff will verify After Party Clean-Up in the Activenet System and write the permit number for rentals on the invoice.

Department accounting staff will process a request for reimbursement in the amount of \$145.50 from Federal Janitorial STG, LLC for the overpayment.

A letter requesting reimbursement has been sent to Federal Janitorial STG, LLC. See attached copy.

Responsible Party:

Response #1 – Tracy Novak, Assistant Parks and Recreation Director, 541-4259

Response #2 – Robert Cortinas, Business/Finance Manager, 541-4335

Implementation Date:

January 7, 2013

**City of El Paso
Internal Audit Office
Federal Janitorial Contract Audit A2012-11**

Finding: 4

Unencumbered Purchases

Accounts Payable Manual Section 8.1.1 states the following:

In order for payment to be processed, a Purchase Order is required for all purchases that are at least \$3,000 but less than \$49,999.

Purchasing Manual Section 7.1 states the following:

...The purchasing thresholds represent limits for the total purchase amount of similar goods and services by all City departments in a fiscal year....

The Janitorial Services Contract #2010-204 has an estimated award of \$74,140.98.

Eight out of 49 (16.33%) invoices for janitorial services during the period of September 1, 2011 to August 31, 2012 were paid with unencumbered vouchers instead of using the Purchase Order established for the Janitorial Services Contract #2010-204. The unencumbered payments totaled \$3,601.03. The invoice numbers and amounts paid are as follows:

#	Invoice	Invoice Date	Description	Actual Payment Amount	Date Paid
1	8949	8/01/2012	Monthly Janitorial Service for Seville	\$ 465.50	8/9/2012
2	8950	8/01/2012	Monthly Janitorial for Don Haskins	\$ 844.68	8/9/2012
3	8948	8/01/2012	Monthly Janitorial Service for Chihuahuaita	\$ 331.92	8/6/2012
4	8622	3/5/2012	After Party Clean-up for Don Haskins	\$ 49.00	3/12/2012
5	8592	2/15/2012	After Party Clean-up for Don Haskins	\$ 48.50	2/22/2012
6	8582	2/15/2012	Janitorial Service for Don Haskins	\$ 930.23	2/22/2012
7	8581	2/15/2012	Janitorial Service for Seville	\$ 465.60	2/22/2012
8	8580	2/15/2012	Janitorial Service for Chihuahuaita	\$ 465.60	2/22/2012
Total				\$ 3,601.03	

Recommendation:

The Parks and Recreation Department should ensure that all payments to Federal Janitorial STG, LLC are paid using the appropriate Purchase Order to ensure an accurate accounting of contract expenditures.

**City of El Paso
Internal Audit Office
Federal Janitorial Contract Audit A2012-11**

Management's Response:

City of El Paso Purchase Order number 2012000907 was issued by the Purchasing Division on October 6, 2011. This Purchase Order was created for use with expenditures associated with contract number 2010-204. Upon reviewing the invoices from September 2011 to August 2012 it was discovered that the invoices had either the wrong Purchase Order number or no Purchase Order number on them. In order to prevent a similar occurrence in the future the Business/Finance Manager will verify accuracy of all invoices, including Purchase Order number. Also, the Business/Finance Manager will verify that all appropriate Purchase Orders are used prior to approving payments in the financial system.

Responsible Party:

Robert Cortinas, Business/Finance Manager, 541-4335

Implementation Date:

January 7, 2013

**City of El Paso
Internal Audit Office
Federal Janitorial Contract Audit A2012-11**

INHERENT LIMITATIONS

Because of the inherent limitations of internal controls, errors or irregularities may occur and not be detected. Also, projections of any evaluation of the internal control structure to future periods are subject to the risk that procedures may become inadequate due to changes in conditions, or that the degree of compliance with the procedures may deteriorate.

CONCLUSION

We have concluded our work on the audit objectives of the Federal Janitorial Contract Audit. In accordance with Generally Accepted Government Auditing Standards, we are required to conclude as to whether the Federal Janitorial STG, LLC met the objectives of this audit. The following is our conclusion.

Federal Janitorial STG, LLC is not in compliance with the contract in the following areas:

- Submitting invoices that are:
 - Itemized,
 - Showing the number of hours worked by each Porter,
 - Indicating the period being billed,
 - Dated after services have been rendered.
- Porters working hours specified in the contract,
- Billing for After Party Clean-ups for events that were not located in the Active Net System.

We have determined that Federal Janitorial STG, LLC overbilled the City of El Paso for janitorial services for the period of September 1, 2011 to August 31, 2012. Federal Janitorial STG, LLC overbilled the City of El Paso in the following categories:

#	Description	Amount
1	Duplicate payments for the month of June 2012	\$1,861.43
2	Over payment on six invoices for monthly janitorial services for three facilities from November 2011 to June 2012	\$1,598.27
3	Over Payment for After Party Clean-Ups	\$145.50
Total Amount Due Back to the City of El Paso		\$3,605.20

The Parks and Recreation Department is not in compliance with the contract in the following areas:

- Reviewing invoices the ensure compliance with contract terms,
- Requiring supporting documentation that janitorial services were rendered according to contract terms,
- Using the Purchase Order established for the contract when paying invoices to Federal Janitorial STG, LCC,

The Parks and Recreation Department needs to request a refund of \$3,605.20 from Federal Janitorial STG, LLC. We recommend that the Parks and Recreation Department evaluate the continuance of Janitorial Services Contract #2010-204 with Federal Janitorial STG, LLC.

**City of El Paso
Internal Audit Office
Federal Janitorial Contract Audit A2012-11**

The implementation of the recommendations provided in this Audit Report should assist the Parks and Recreation Department improve their internal controls over contract compliance.

We wish to thank the management and staff of the Parks and Recreation Department and Federal Janitorial STG, LLC for their assistance and courtesies extended during the completion of this audit.

Signature on File

Edmundo S. Calderón, CIA, CGAP, CRMA, MBA
Chief Internal Auditor

Signature on File

Rebecca Garcia
Auditor

Distribution:

Financial and Audit Oversight Committee
Joyce A. Wilson, City Manager
David R. Almonte, Deputy City Manager
Nanette Smejkal, Director of Parks and Recreation